A new Concept for System Communication	**Christian Heller** Thorsten Kunze Jens Bohl Ilka Philippow	christian.heller@tu-ilmenau.de info@torstenkunze.de info@jens-bohl.de ilka.philippow@tu-ilmenau.de	
	Reviewer #1	**Reviewer #2**	**Reviewer #3**
Assessment (1-6)			
Scientific quality		5	3
Innovation		3	4
Relevance		2	3
Presentation		4	2
Interest		3	3
Confidence in your Assessment		Highly confident	Highly confident
Judgement		weak reject	accept
Revision necessary		yes	no
Comments to the Author(s)			
Main contribution		This paper provides an idea and a structure for domain specific applications, represented by domain model, to access local or remote data sources. The same idea and structure can also be used for communication between modules/systems.	1) The paper presents three design patterns which are combined to a framework. 2) The rationale of this project is the persistent communication in the medical domain
Positive aspects		Well structured. Vivid example, human body, used to illustrate communication. Main idea was stated very clear	1) Well written, the application and combination of the patterns is sound 2) All in all a nice example for the application of patterns and object oriented software engineering.
Negative aspects		*See end of paper	The paper presents some experience made made by applying software engineering concepts. If it is intended to present some research in software engineering, a chapter about related research and a clear focus on the specific contribution would be required.
Additional comments		There should be a comparison with other structures and a discussion about the pros and cons of CYBOP, especially the advantages of using this framework to design a software system, as a conclusion part.	
Reason for rejection		*See end of paper	
Topic Area			
Object-Oriented Technolgies and Concepts			X
Component-based approaches and Software Product Lines		X	

Agent technology, Database Systems, Exchange Formats, Middleware and the Web			
Knowledge Management for the Internet			
Applications and Challenges in E-Business and E-Government			
*Negative aspects and Reason for rejection by Reviewer #2			
	1) Lack of technical details: details for the implementation of this framework		
	2) Lack of any validation or evidence of the proposed features of the approach		
	3) Lack of comparing the results with existing solutions and research results		
	4) Novelty: The title says a NEW concept is introduced, but this is not a new concept at all. For example, the ISO OSI model for network includes ID, package, application level, etc. which also intend to separate the application from its lower level communication.		
	5) Abstract: The first sentence 'This document describes how existing design patterns can be extended and combined…', may mislead the readers that any kind of existing design patterns can be extended to the framework CYBOP. In fact, CYBOP was based on concepts from Data Mapper and MVC.		
	6) Abstract: It says n the ABSTRACT, 'the concept of Ontology is used to structure the software architecture…', but no		
	7) The framework is called a Cybernetics Oriented Programming (CYBOP). But no definition or explanation of		